



Interactive comment on “Observation of 2nd Schumann eigenmode on Titan’s surface” by C. Béghin et al.

C. Béghin et al.

cbeghin@cnrs-orleans.fr

Received and published: 27 August 2013

The reviewer is referring to the initial manuscript submitted on 28 January, instead of the revised version on 7 April, accepted and GID on-line on 19 April after recommendations from the two first reviewers. Therefore most of comments of Dr Navarro are obsolete and only few of them are considered by the authors when judged necessary, as beloww:

"The manuscript should include a data sharing statement which either says where extra data can be accessed" Reply: OK, the link is http://atmos.nmsu.edu/PDS/data/hphasi_0001/

[Full Screen / Esc](#)

[Printer-friendly Version](#)

[Interactive Discussion](#)

[Discussion Paper](#)



[Interactive
Comment](#)

"Simulation seems not valid because assumes a sinusoidal .signal as noise,.." Reply : The reviewer seems ignoring that the DFT of signal plus noise is a combination of complex vectors (Eq 8), whatever their temporal waveform be sinusoidal or not.

" Authors should make some plot of graphical explanation of this jump (S36)" Reply : The reviewer seems to not having taken attention to Fig.6, lower panel.

" Authors should cite the work of Morente et al. (2008).. " Reply: By this last point, the reviewer reveals his own involvement in a conflict between the team of Dr Morente and the PWA team, resulting in several Comments and Rebutals, such as:

Hamelin et al, Comment on "Evidence on Titan drawn from the Schuman resonances sent by Huygens probe" by J.A. Morente et al. [2008, Icarus, 195, 802-811], Icarus, 204 (2009), 349-351.

Grard et al., Comment on "an analysis of VLF electric field spectra measured in Titan's atmosphere by the Huygens probe" by J.A; Morente et al. JOURNAL OF GEOPHYSICAL RESEARCH, VOL. 116, E05005, doi:10.1029/2009JE003555, 2011.

The authors of the present paper do not wish to comment anymore the work of Morente et al, by respect after the decease of the latter.

[Interactive comment on Geosci. Instrum. Method. Data Syst. Discuss., 3, 157, 2013.](#)

[Full Screen / Esc](#)[Printer-friendly Version](#)[Interactive Discussion](#)[Discussion Paper](#)